Daniel H. Hurt

Professor: Dr. Paul Ohler

English 1100-A79

September 23rd, 2019

Essay #1 (15%)

Practical Integration Policy for Western Countries;

A Comparative Analysis of Stakeholder Perspectives:

English 1100-A79

Practical Integration Policy For Western Countries;

A Comparative Analysis of Stakeholder Perspectives:

In the contemporary political context, when discussing the merits of differing immigration policies between states, and their outcomes, it is important to contextualize the role of the state in this process, and establish what its goals are in a given national context. It is the goal of every state to best serve the interests of its leadership; the same holds true regardless of whether such a state is possessed of a democratic framework, or an autocratic one, though the structurally encouraged time preferences endemic to the leadership differ between the two (Hoppe, Hans H. Democracy The God That Failed--The Economics and Politics of Monarchy, Democracy, and Natural Order . 9th ed.); this, in the case of largely democratic western governments, has the effect of disincentivizing long-term strategic planning. Central to the state's goal of self-preservation and advancement, is the maintenance of such economic activity as is necessary to fund the autonomous spending liabilities of the state; however, little structural incentive is given to consideration of the long-term ramifications of whatever means is utilized to accomplish this goal, or any potentially harmful societal externalities generated therefrom. Therefore, it is for reasons of slackening birth rates in western

countries, along with reduced relative frontal cost in training and lead-time when importing skilled workers from abroad, as compared to training them domestically from birth, that western governments have induced a policy of encouraging unprecedented rates of immigration into their countries in recent decades; with the current annual figure of new immigrants coming in typically being approximately 0.5% and 1% of the total existing national population, in the United States and Canada respectively (Kymlicka, Will. "Immigration, Citizenship, Multiculturalism: Exploring the Links).

The impact of 'brain drain' on typically less developed nations via emigration notwithstanding, it is also apparent that such a process shall invariably generate varying degrees of integration problems for the destination countries, their existing populaces, and the immigrants themselves; the appropriate degree of integration, and whether the state should bear a role in orchestrating the rate of naturalization is a matter of spirited debate amongst stakeholders in both government, academia, and immigrant communities themselves. To cite the expressed views of one immigrant thought leader with knowledge on the subject, Neil Bissoondath, a Trinidadian-Canadian author, who immigrated to Canada at the age of 18, wrote a book on the subject, and subsequently published an article, which is contained in the September 1998 issue of "The Internationalist"

magazine, wherein he told his own personal story, and laid out the problems that he—and many immigrant friends and colleagues of his—identified with multiculturalism as a stated national policy (Bissoondath, Neil. "Multiculturalism, or No Place Like Home: Neil Bissondath Uncovers The Cracks In Canada's Multicultural Mosaic.").

Mr. Bissoondath rightly identifies that multiculturalism is flawed as governmental policy, insofar as it presumes that (1) cultures can be seamlessly transplanted across regions without changing, despite the people who hail from that cultural background finding themselves in a new socio-cultural environment, (2) that immigrants shall wish to retain the social outlook and cultural practices of the land they voluntarily departed from, and (3) that such a goal of cultural preservation via multiple "cultural" enclaves balkanized adjacent to one another, or overlapping into a 'multi-cultural' mosaic, is somehow compatible with what he perceives as the necessary process of integration, which aids in attaining employment, and avoiding social isolation. However, as his critique of multiculturalism was published in the context of a mass-market book—with the crux of it summarized thereafter in a media article—rather than an academic journal, governmental report, or peer reviewed source, its argumentational formatting differs from academic norms, with many of his points regrettably

comprising mere subjective anecdotes. With the exception of citing an unspecified 1993 poll showing 72% support amongst the existing Canadian population for ending official multiculturalism in Canada, the article at least, makes few references to tangible data (Bissoondath, Neil. "Multiculturalism, or No Place Like Home: Neil Bissoondath Uncovers The Cracks In Canada's Multicultural Mosaic."). While Mr. Bissoondath's original source could not be verified at the time of writing, his claims are largely corroborated by a more recent poll from 2016, which asked similar questions; the 2016 poll pegged the rate of opposition to the current multiculturalist immigration policy amongst respondents at 68%, and expressed 79% support for an economically nationalist immigration policy ala the Trump Regime in the United States (Proctor, Jason. "Canadians Want Minorities to Do More to 'fit In': CBC-Angus Reid Institute Poll News." CBC).

Mr. Bissoondath's outlook with regards to the debilitating nature of multiculturalism has been met with harsh criticism from the Canadian political mainstream, as well as—bizarrely—some identitarian intellectuals, who view multicultural balkanization as preferable to integration (Duchesne, Richardo. "Neil Bissoondath's Selling Illusions. The Cult of Multiculturalism in Canada: 20 Years Later."; Duchesne, Ricardo, and Derek Turner. "Will Kymlicka and the Disappearing Dominion."). Conversely, in regards to the comparative views on

immigration policy amongst the Canadian political mainstream, such are epitomised by the writings of Will Kymlicka, whose fervent defence of multiculturalism has earned him the support of the federal government, which has, on multiple occasions, authorized him to draft white paper's on behalf of federal government departments, proposing policy changes for their operations, that they may better align with the stated goal of successfully achieving and preserving multiculturalism in Canada (Kymlicka, Will. The Current State Of Multiculturalism In Canada And Research Themes On Canadian Multiculturalism 2008–2010. Department of Citizenship And Immigration Canada).

Mr. Kymlicka's views on citizenship, immigration, and multiculturalism—though endorsed by the state, the media, and the upper echelons of academia—do not align with the views of the general public, based on the studies previously cited within this document. From the details laid out in one of his writings, Kymlicka appears to be in favour of multiculturalism—which he views as an inevitability—and favours a "revaluing of citizenship", and immigrant naturalization to further that goal, with the understanding that such shall invariably lead to dual loyalties among immigrants. He couches his assessment in the assertion that dual loyalties are acceptable, insofar as they are unlikely to harm the social fabric in states lacking a history of being a colonial power, yet he also prescribes the same

solution—multiculturalism—to states such as the United Kingdom, which clearly

do, (Kymlicka, Will. "Immigration, Citizenship, Multiculturalism: Exploring the

Links.").

On page 205 of the aforementioned document, Mr. Kymlicka claims—

without evidence—that increasing the size of the nation's labour force via

importation of immigrants on work visas who have failed to secure employment

prior to arrival, shall somehow result in a "net increase in the number of jobs"

being filled in the labour force; while it is hypothetically possible that increasing

the pool of available workers shall decrease the value of labour in the economy to

such an extent that businesses which would otherwise not be viable may develop,

and subsequently hire new workers, any increase in the net GDP from such a

policy would likely come at an expense to the GDP per capita, as all labour would

face a devaluation. Likewise, on the same page, he expresses willful ignorance of

the negative impacts of illegal immigration and false refugee claimants to national

security, in light of high rates of naturalisation, divergent loyalties, and the impacts

of the welfare state (Facchini, Giovanni, and Anna Maria Mayda. "Does The

Welfare State Affect Individual Attitudes Toward Immigrants? Evidence Across

Countries."). Additionally, without citing any examples, he alleges that other

nations have faced higher rates of illegal aliens on their soil than the United

Kingdom, without negative repercussions, and concludes his thesis with the notion that the British Government should throw caution to the wind, and join in the multicultural experiment on which the rest of the west has gone, without employing their own unique strategy. Furthermore, his conclusion that we are living in a "new age of migration" by necessity, fails to consider that technological change can, through automation, offset some economic impacts of population contraction, and that an open immigration policy is a conscious choice laid out in response to prevailing trends by governments, rather than a historic inevitability. Taken from this perspective, a cautious approach—as that of the British cited in Kymlicka's article undeniably is—may be the right one (Kymlicka, Will. "Immigration, Citizenship, Multiculturalism: Exploring the Links.").

Sources Cited:

Bissoondath, Neil. "Multiculturalism, or No Place Like Home: Neil Bissondath Uncovers The Cracks In Canada's Multicultural Mosaic." The New Internationalist, September 1998. Accessed September 23, 2019. https://newint.org/features/1998/09/05/multiculturalism.

Bissoondath, Neil. Selling Illusions: The Cult of Multiculturalism in Canada. 1994.

Dosanjh, Ujjal. "Diversity is Not Yet Strength in Canada | Ujjal Dosanjh #WalrusTalks." YouTube, The Walrus, 15 Mar. 2018, www.youtube.com/watch?v=OGQ090Vtqeo. Accessed 23 Sept. 2019.

Duchesne, Ricardo, and Derek Turner. "Will Kymlicka and the Disappearing Dominion." The Quarterly Review, University of New Brunswick, 27 Aug. 2019, www.quarterly-review.org/will-kymlicka-and-the-disappearing-dominion/. Accessed 23 Sept. 2019.

Duchesne, Richardo. "Neil Bissoondath's Selling Illusions. The Cult of Multiculturalism in Canada: 20 Years Later." Council of European Canadians, Council of European Canadians, 8 Aug. 2004, www.eurocanadian.ca/2014/08/neil-bissoondaths-selling-illusions.html. Accessed 23 Sept. 2019.

Facchini, Giovanni, and Anna Maria Mayda. "Does The Welfare State Affect Individual Attitudes Toward Immigrants? Evidence Accross Countries." The Review of Economics and Statistics, vol. 91, no. 2, 2009, pp. 295–314. JSTOR, www.jstor.org/stable/25651339.

Heyking, John V. "Multiculturalism and problems of Canadian unity." OPUS Home, University of Lethbridge Research Repository OPUS, 2010, http://opus.uleth.ca/bitstream/handle/10133/3268/Multiculturalism-Bavaria-Paper-2%200.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y

Hoppe, Hans H. Democracy The God That Failed--The Economics and Politics of Monarchy, Democracy, and Natural Order . 9th ed., Transaction Publishers, New Brunswick, New Jersey, USA, 2001, https://mises.org/library/democracy-god-failed-1. www.riosmauricio.com/wp-content/uploads/2013/04/Hoppe_Democracy_The_God_That_Failed.pdf. Accessed 23 Sept. 2019.

Kymlicka, Will. "Immigration, Citizenship, Multiculturalism: Exploring the Links." The Political Quarterly, vol. 74, no. 1, Jan. 2003, pp. 195-208, Research Gate.

www.researchgate.net/publication/200820348_Immigration_Citizenship_Multicult uralism_Exploring_the_Links. Accessed 23 Sept. 2019.

Kymlicka, Will. The Current State Of Multiculturalism In Canada And Research Themes On Canadian Multiculturalism 2008–2010. Department of Citizenship And Immigration Canada--Minister of Public Works and Government Services Canada, 2010. http://publications.gc.ca/site/archivee- archived.html?url=http://publications.gc.ca/collections/collection_2011/cic/Ci96- 112-2010-eng.pdf. http://publications.gc.ca/collections/collection_2011/cic/Ci96- 112-2010-eng.pdf. Accessed 23 Sept. 2019.

Proctor, Jason. "Canadians Want Minorities to Do More to 'fit In': CBC-Angus Reid Institute Poll News." CBC, 30 Sept. 2016, www.cbc.ca/news/canada/british- columbia/poll-canadians-multiculturalism-immigrants-1.3784194. Accessed 23 Sept. 2019.